

Urban Transport Benchmarking Initiative Year Three



Annex A5.1

Urban Transport for Disabled People

Annex to final report

July 2006



Annex A5.1

Urban Transport for Disabled People Working Group

Annex to final report

Prepared for

European Commission
Directorate General for
Energy and Transport

by



Author(s)	Sam Roberts; Philip Barham
Quality Control	Sarah Clifford
Project Manager	Kieran Holmes
Project Number	L/05/256
Version	Final
Date	31st July 2006
File location	TTR PROJECTS\CURRENT PROJECTS\EC Benchmarking Year 3\Technical\Final Reports
Last edited	31st July 2006
This report has been prepared for European Commission DG TREN in accordance with the terms and conditions of appointment. Transport & Travel Research Ltd cannot accept any responsibility for any use of or reliance on the contents of this report by any third party.	

CONTENTS

1	INTRODUCTION.....	1
2	DATA COLLECTION FORM GUIDE - YEAR THREE.....	2
2.1	Making public transport accessible versus funding dedicated services.....	2
2.2	Training.....	2
2.3	Agenda for accessibility	3
2.4	Social Benefits	3
3	GATHERED DATA – YEAR THREE	4

1 INTRODUCTION

This document represents Annex A5.1 of the Urban Transport Benchmarking Initiative final reports from year three and contains information in support of the final report of the Urban Transport for Disabled People working group.

This document has been produced in a slightly different format to the rest of the Urban Transport Benchmarking reports in order to conform with standards set by the UK Department for Transport for visually impaired readers.

Contained within this document is the thematic data collection form and the raw data submitted by the working group participants.

2 DATA COLLECTION FORM GUIDE - YEAR THREE

This section of the annex contains a copy of the Urban Transport for Disabled People thematic data collection form.

Year Three:

2.1 Making public transport accessible versus funding dedicated services

Issue	Indicator
Making public transport accessible versus funding dedicated services	Is there any specialist wheelchair accessible transport provision for disabled people in your city / region?
	How is this funded and operated?
	How much money has been invested in making public transport accessible? [Not including school transport]
	How much money has been invested in specialist transport services for disabled people per year per head of population?
	Has any research been done to quantify the benefits of this investment in public transport?
	What are the impacts of this investment?
	Has any research been done to quantify the benefits of this investment in specialist transport provision? [e.g number of trips]
	What are the impacts of this investment? [goals of Public Transport?]
	How has the number of disabled passengers carried changed over the years 2000 to 2004?
	How many complaints related to accessibility have been received from disabled passengers over the years 2000 to 2004?
What has been the impact of this investment on the lives of disabled people within your region? [Descriptive answer?]	

2.2 Training

Issue	Indicator
Training	How much disability awareness training is given and to whom? [Please differentiate between technical – use of ramps etc... – and non-technical - understanding of needs etc...]

	Are disabled people involved in the training process? If yes, to what extent?
	What marketing is undertaken specifically aimed at disabled people?
	What information is available specifically for disabled people?

2.3 Agenda for accessibility

Issue	Indicator
Agenda for accessibility	What is the geographical coverage of accessible public transport coverage across your city / region?
	How is disability defined by your organisation?
	What proportion of your transport network is wheelchair accessible?
	Is there a deadline for full accessibility of the transport network? If so when is it?

2.4 Social Benefits

Issue	Indicator
Social Benefits	What wider social benefits have been seen as a result of the investment in providing transport for disabled people? [Itemise benefits - descriptive]
	What disbenefits have there been?

3 GATHERED DATA – YEAR THREE

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
<p>Is there any specialist wheelchair accessible transport provision for disabled people in your city / region?</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>no</p>	<p>Specialised services have existed in Ile de France since 1983. At first operated by 13 non profit associations operating 600,000 trips/year with 200 vehicles. After 2002 STIF decided along with Regional Council of Ile de France (IDF) to give a new framework to the activity based on a booking and operating centre per county (8 counties in total in IDF) The first one was PAM 75.</p>	<p>There are several initiatives mostly dependent on the work of volunteers (Minder Mobielen Centrale) All these volunteer-based specialist services fall under the common denominator DAV (Diensten voor Aangepast Vervoer/ services for specially adapted transport)</p> <p>In other words, these voluntary specialist services fall outside the scope of regular public transport activities.</p> <p>In the Antwerp Greater Metropolitan Area, there is an ongoing experiment involving close collaboration with voluntary specialist transport services (Antwerpse Rolkar) and the Taxi sector. The De Lijn Belbuscentrale (call centre for buses on demand) coordinates all incoming calls from disabled people. If the regular bus/tram line is serviced by fully accessible rolling stock and all bus/tram stops are equally accessible, no specific measures have to be taken.</p> <p>If rolling stock is not wheelchair-accessible or some bus/tram stops on this connection are not accessible, a “Belbus”(bus on demand) is sent out. If no “Belbus” is available, the Belbuscentrale calls a taxi or a DAV to pick up the handicapped person.</p> <p>Depending on the results of this Antwerp experiment, this coordination mechanism could eventually be extended to other Flemish regions, whereby the VVM Belbuscentrales would centralise and coordinate all incoming calls from disabled people.</p>

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt	
How is this funded?	N/A	-	Since 2002 funding is coming from STIF + Regional Council + County+ users direct fare (20to 25%decreasing)	<p>Specialist transport services for handicapped people do not categorise as regular PT services. Consequently, there are no specific budget provisions within the normal funding of VVM De Lijn for organising and planning such specialised , dedicated transport services.</p> <p>Under the responsibility of the Flemish minister for Equal Chances (Gelijke Kansen), there is a specific budget for funding these so-called DAV (Diensten voor Aangepast Vervoer)</p> <p>In the near future, a generalisation of the Antwerp experiment could be envisaged. In such a scenario, the call-centres ("Belbuscentrales) of VVM De Lijn could function as coordination centres transmitting incoming calls to taxis and DAV.</p>	
How much money has been invested in making public transport accessible?	<p>In the last decade all vehicles have been changed to low entry kneeling buses. When bus stops and terminals is build or rebuild, we try to take disabled people into consideration. Furthermore we have a network of buses that is suited to service elderly and disabled people. The driver can help the passengers because there is extra time in the timetable. Therefore it is very difficult to give the specific amount of money invested in making public transport accessible.</p>		<p>METRO: € 301,000 Surface transport: not calculated separately, it is part of the financial resources allocated for the rehabilitation of each vehicle</p>	<p>Around 200million Euros (STIF + Regional council</p>	

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
How much money has been invested in specialist transport services for disabled people per year?	1,640,000 €	-	1 Euro per inhabitant (11ME for 11M population)	350131.61
Has any research been done to quantify the benefits of this investment in public transport?	None	no	No study conducted in Ile de France only wheel chair users have been numbered on RATP (which means only part of the network) bus lines and recently heavy rail lines	

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
What are the impacts of this investment?	The service buses have become very popular among elderly people. Even though the operating efficiency is lower than the regular bus lines there is no intentions to reduce the service.	-	RATP has numbered around 18000 travellers in wheel chair on the bus lines exclusively in 2005. The only evaluation I can make is compare to the average cost of a Door to Door (5PAM) service of 30€/trip but not all of the trips would have been made by D to D considering a fare of 6€ instead of 1,40 on Public Transport	
Has any research been done to quantify the benefits of this investment in specialist transport provision?	No	no	Number of trips by disabled people on Public Transport only figure is 18,000 on bus lines (see above). No counting on heavy rail (problems boarding train) Number of D to D trips in 2005 was around 900,000. But the INFOMOBI service says that 60% of the demand for a travel plan (origin to destination) by a wheelchair user finds a solution on the accessible part of Public Transport network.	

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
What are the impacts of this investment?	N/A	-	PTA has an obligation (mandatory by law) to make Public Transport network accessible; in case of impossibility PTA has to provide alternative services (including DtoD but not only). The goal then is to balance the costs of each kind of services Public Transport accessible, DtoD and other demand responsive or ...	
How has the number of disabled passengers carried changed over the years 2000 to 2004?	N/A	N/A	it has changed significantly from 2000 when only 5 bus lines at RATP were accessible to 2004 when 25 were accessible (travellers in wheelchairs from 2000 a year to 18,000 a year)	During the period stretching from 1st January 2003 until today, 117,708 VG seasonal tickets have been distributed (VG= Flemish Fund for the Integration of Handicapped Persons)The growth rate for this type of special season ticket for disabled persons = approximately 700 /month.

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
<p>How many complaints related to accessibility have been received from disabled passengers over the years 2000 to 2004?</p>	<p>We have no registration of complaints particularly related to disabled passengers. The level of complaints is constant and between 5-10 complaints every year.</p>		<p>figure not yet available (must sort out disability related complaints from general complaints)</p>	<p>Prior to 2002, we are not in the possession of any relevant statistical data on this topic. During the period stretching from 2002 till 31st December 2004, 10 complaints pertaining to accessibility problems have been received in the whole Province of Limburg. 2 out of 10 complaints were related to accessibility problems in the urban area of HASSELT. Out of the 10 accessibility-related complaints in Limburg; 1 referred to inaccessible bus stops, the 9 other complaints were related to inaccessible rolling stock. The 2 complaints referring to accessibility problems in the Hasselt urban area were both referring to inaccessible rolling stock. During the period stretching from 1st January 2005 until today, 36 complaints related to accessibility problems have been received in the Limburg Province. Subdivided according to our codification* 8 complaints concerned inaccessible bus stops* 25 complaints had something to do with inaccessible rolling stock* 3 complaints referred to "other accessibility problems" (neither rolling stock nor bus stops) Further subdividing of these data on the basis of urban area gives us the following picture for the URBAN AREA OF HASSELT 2 complaints related to bus stops 3 complaints related to inaccessible rolling stock 1 complaint about "other" accessibility problems For the entire period from beginning 2002 until today, a total of 8 complaints have been received in the Hasselt city area. For the Province of Limburg, the total number of complaints in the 2002-2006 period reached 46 complaints. Remarkable statistical fact: The more actions we undertake to improve the overall degree of accessibility, the more complaints we seem to receive. Improved (real) accessibility does not automatically result in a proportionate diminishing of the number of accessibility-related complaints, quite the contrary is true. Increased awareness within the disabled community and targeted communication campaigns can probably explain this remarkable evolution.</p>

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
What has been the impact of this investment on the lives of disabled people within your region?	N/A	-	Generally speaking making the Public Transport network accessible proved very comfortable for all passengers. For example low floor buses are easier to board and result in a saving of time for the boarding/alighting process thus productivity is increased or at least maintained when taking on board a wheelchair user who needs the ramp process. Also lifts more and more common in stations are used by all the people who need or like them.	
How much disability awareness training is given and to whom? (Please differentiate between technical – use of ramps etc... – and non-technical - understanding of needs etc...)	None		Disability awareness training is given by RATP as an intern training scheme for bus drivers and RER/metro conductors and staff in station. Same happens with SNCF who issued a tape explaining the "curriculum". This is for the operators staff supposed to be in contact with disabled travellers. To my knowledge very little has been done for other staff or for executives whether they be at SNCF, RATP, or any public body dealing with Public Transport	For the time being, the HR-department organises a 1 day training/person/year on a variety of topics. In the near future, 50% of this training time (half a day) will be devoted to customer attitudes. Coping with mobility-impaired persons constitutes a substantial part of this training. Before and after normal working hours, 2 hours specialised training/driver/year will be devoted to handling wheelchair passengers in our buses and trams. Depending on the available government budgets, this kind of specialised training could become incorporated in the "basic training" curriculum for freshly recruited debutante bus/tram drivers, thus complementing the existing training programme. In the near future, 3 extra days will be devoted towards ATTITUDE . Within this framework, our drivers will, during their basic training period immediately after recruitment, become acquainted with the specific difficulties and needs of disabled persons.

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
<p>Are disabled people involved in the training process? If yes, to what extent?</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Yes disabled people representative (on a regional or national scale) have been involved in the process of making the SNCF tape for example. More should be done and particularly more in depth for a general awareness is good but not sufficient and the services (or equipments) tend to be more and more sophisticated this calls for focused training on both parts : operator staff and user's</p>	<p>During the training course, we collaborate closely with the "Toegankelijkheidsbureau" (Accessibility Bureau) who invite handicapped people to come and testify, before an audience of drivers, about their personal experiences in PTThe cost of specific training programmes for drivers:* DVD-movie: 6 000 Euro* Wages: 131,356 Euro* Fees trainers: 60,000 Euro* Fees Accessibility Bureau (Toegankelijkheidsbureau) = 5000 euroTotal amount spent on specific training for drivers, learning them how to cope with disabled persons= 200,000 euro</p>

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
<p>What marketing is undertaken specifically aimed at disabled people?</p>	<p>None</p>	<p>-</p>	<p>No marketing per se, only INFOMOBI is giving information provided the person know INFOMOBI exists; so far INFOMOBI remained rather confidential relying only on the association spreading words on it. Marketing hasn't been an issue so far for PTA considering the poor overall level of accessibility on the network. This will have to change because the February 11 2005 law in fact encourages people with disability to use PT, therefore communication on the achievements of accessibility will be necessary (I believe). There is an exception though : INFOMOBI will have a space (funded by STIF) at the Salon Autonomic (special fair on disability issues every other year) very popular among specialist and associations (STIF funded also a place at the 2004 Autonomic fair)</p>	<p>Since the beginning of 2006, our marketing department has published a brochure specifically intended for our disabled passengers. Its title is "Op-stap zonder drempel: Toegankelijkheid bij De Lijn" (Moving around without thresholds: accessibility and De Lijn. This brochure provides a definition of an "accessible journey", the technicalities of travelling as a handicapped person, the assistance provided by our drivers, the reservation system for wheelchair users, special reduced fares for the disabled, frequently asked questions, where to look for specialised information etc. The last page of this brochure contains a leaflet which the wheelchair user can send back to the marketing department of De Lijn. Wheelchair users can identify the bus/tram stops they use most frequently, so that the highest priority can be given to making those bus/tram stops fully accessible. Internally, this brochure has been distributed to all 5 regional entities, all bus/tram depots, call centres, Lijn-Shops, stations, maintenance centres, back office, buses and trams etc. Externally, on the basis of a mailing list gathering relevant data about the representative Federations of Disabled persons (subdivided according to type of disability) this brochure has been largely distributed to all associations defending the interests of the handicapped. The folder on accessibility is an initiative coming from the Central Services (Headquarters in Mechelen). Regional entities can complement this general information with specific background information about local ongoing accessibility projects in their region. The communication and marketing campaign on accessibility was launched in Antwerp the 10th and 11th April 2006 with a Press Conference by the Flemish Mobility minister, Kathleen van Brempt. During this ministerial press conference, the following topics were treated: * Actual situation accessibility in PT- timescale and future agenda for accessibility * Making a reservation for an accessible journey * Presentation of accessible urban transport network Antwerp * Reservation Belbuscentrale for deaf and hearing-impaired using a fax message During the month of April 2006, an extensive mailing action was started, targeting the representative associations defending the interests of the disabled. A letter was sent to all handicap-specific organisations on Flemish (regional) and provincial level. This letter contained information on the following items: * Brief overview of the broader context, situating the problem of accessibility * Announcement extension accessibility * Presentation of accessibility folder and request for cooperation towards the organisations representing the handicapped people. * Free DVD on accessible public transport in Flanders * VVM De Lijn tailor-made information sessions on demand, free of charge * Referring to our website, where press releases, interview texts, photographic material can be downloaded, free of charge. Accompanying this letter, a press package has been distributed to the "specialised press", mainly periodicals, magazines and newsletters, which the disabled associations regularly send to their members. In order to streamline future marketing and communication campaigns, specifically aimed at disabled passengers, VVM De Lijn is setting up a database containing the data of important contact persons within the various associations representing the disabled. After careful analysis of incoming complaints or questions about accessible PT, De Lijn will produce a list of frequently asked questions on accessibility, with standardised answers. In a later stage, this FAQ-list will be available on De Lijn's website.</p>

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
What information is available specifically for disabled people?	Folders/website	-		<p>* Brochure, edition 2006, "Op-stap zonder drempel: Toegankelijkheid bij De Lijn"* Our website www.delijn.be contains a specific section for the disabled (visually) Beside the general information on accessibility; the website also contains specific information provided by the regional entities. The website also contains a registration form, allowing members of representative organisations defending the interests of the disabled, to ask for a specific information session. A ready-made documentation package has been made for the press (press releases, pictures) In the future, our own "routefinder" will play a central role in helping the disabled person to find out how to plan his trip in optimal circumstances. The route finder on our website will indicate the various transport possibilities for the wheelchair user. The general web pages will be produced by Headquarters, while every regional entity, municipality, transport area will be invited to put local information on the website.* DVD on accessibility: free of charge, to be used during training courses for drivers, call-centre collaborators or during information sessions requested by associations representing the disabled.* PowerPoint presentation: complementing the information available on DVD: can be used for presentations for associations of the disabled or for internal training purposes</p>
What is the geographical coverage of accessible public transport coverage across your city / region?	55 square kilometre		<p>The strategy of the PTA in IDF is to make accessible the regional network (heavy rail and bus lines) starting with the main stations or lines in terms of passengers, connexions and intermodality, and specific interest for the disabled. Reminder: STIF is a regional PTA.</p>	

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
How is disability defined by your organisation?	<p>There is no definition of disability in public transport in Aalborg in general. But if you want to use the door-to-door service you need to suffer from impaired motor function, use wheel chair, crutches or walking frame. You also need to be 16 years and your disability needs to last longer then 12 months.</p>	<p>Disabled persons are: disabled persons required special protection, person over 70 years, pregnant women, small children (0-4 year), persons with temporary locomotor disability, sick persons, persons carrying luggage.</p>	<p>accessibility is defined by the law : people with all kind of handicaps and people with reduced mobility as defined in the 2001-85CE bus directive*</p>	<p>Flanders and VVM De Lijn have purposely opted for not defining the concept of "disability" Instead, we have produced a crystal-clear definition of an "accessible journey" A journey can be described as being ACCESSIBLE if 3 conditions are simultaneously fulfilled, namely: • The bus/tram stops for getting on and off the bus/tram are accessible • The vehicle (tram/bus) is accessible • The space reserved for anchoring and securing a wheelchair is free (every vehicle has only 1 wheelchair-anchorage at its disposal) In order to find out if he/she can embark on an "accessible journey", the disabled person should call the "Belbuscentrale" (call-centre for buses-on-demand) where a collaborator will do the necessary research</p>

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
<p>What proportion of your transport network is wheelchair accessible?</p>	<p>All the buses are low entry kneeling buses. If wheelchair users requires help to get into the buses running on the regular bus lines they must bring an assistant. On the service buses the bus driver is allowed to help wheelchair users because there is extra time in the timetable.</p>	<p>under 1 percent</p>	<p>Heavy rail: 50% that is 134/254 stations of the "priority network" is accessible or work in progress. The priority network is 254 stations out of 440 in total excluding metro) Bus lines around 50% are accessible or work in progress in Paris, out of area the figure drops dramatically to around 5% (1280 bus lines in total in IDF). The problem is many bus stops have been improved to meet accessibility requirements 4M€ to 8M€ per year in the past 2 years but spread over many different lines and until one line has all the stops exhaustively worked on, it is not considered "accessible" and no information is given to the public) for fear of misleading complaints).</p>	
<p>Is there a deadline for full accessibility of the transport network? If so when is it?</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>yes</p>	<p>full accessibility is to be achieved in 2015 by law</p>	<p>By 2022, all rolling stock, including tram vehicles, should be fully accessible without any restriction whatsoever...Making the more than 40 000 bus/tram stops in Flanders accessible; remains an enormous challenge, where no timetable has been set yet. VVM De Lijn can only assume responsibility for accessibility of rolling stock: making infrastructure accessible is the responsibility of the road managers (region, province or municipality/local council, depending on the road category)</p>

Indicator	Aalborg	Bucharest	Ile de France	Hasselt
What wider social benefits have been seen as a result of the investment in providing transport for disabled people? [Itemise benefits - descriptive]		-	So far very little benefits have been seen, mostly because either improvements are spread over the network (see bus lines accessibility above) or the whole chain isn't accessible for instance on the heavy rail network it remains difficult to board the train. SNCF and RATP have been working on the subject since 2 years at least, experiments have been done (bridging plates) but full implementation will take time. In the meantime disabled people don't dare use the network for fear of not getting to their destination easily, Associations acknowledge the progress made but expectancies remain very high. On the other hand, 18000 rides (see question 1-6 above) means the beginning of integration: these are people who would no have been able to ride with old fashion buses, also as they can travel on the PT they also want to get to places that in turn have to be made accessible (museums for ex;) one effort leads to another in terms of public responsibility. Also trips done by DtoD services are significantly increasing in Paris and in Val de Marne (département east from Paris) where PAM services have been launched, meaning an overall increase in mobility which participates to a better quality of life. One thing is, most probably benefits of accessibility of PT and a fair provision of DtoD will not show on PT balance sheet as much as on social welfare balance sheet.	Social integration of disabled persons has made enormous progress, thanks to increased mobility.
What disbenefits have there been?		-	Hard to assess	